



Landmarks & Urban
Conservation Commission



Agenda Number: 7
Case No.: 09-LUCC-50043
Project # 1008057
November 18, 2009

Staff Report

Agent		Staff Recommendation	
Applicant	Jeremy McCollum	APPROVAL of Case # 09-LUCC-50043, Project #1008057, a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for alteration, based on the Findings 1-8 on page 7 and subject to Condition 1 on page 8.	
Request	Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction		
Legal Description	Lot 35 Coronado Place Addition		
Address/Location	1005 Forrester		
Size			
Zoning	SU2/SF	Maryellen Hennessy Staff Planner	
Historic Location	Eighth and Forrester Historic Overlay Zone		

Summary of Analysis

The application is for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a new accessory building in the Eighth and Forrester Historic Overlay Zone.

The subject property is non-contributing to the historic district. It is a simple one-story gable roofed single-family house built ca. 1994. The proposed accessory building is of similar style and massing as the main house and utilizes similar building materials. This is an appropriate approach.

The new building is to be located in the rear yard and will be minimally visible from the right-of way. It is subordinate to the main building. This is also an appropriate approach. The integrity of the streetscape is not negatively affected by the proposed structure.

The proposed alterations are appropriate and the historic architectural character of the Eighth and Forrester Historic Overlay Zone is sufficiently preserved to meet applicable guidelines.

PRIMARY REFERENCES:

Landmarks and Urban Conservation Ordinance; Design Guidelines for the Eighth and Forrester Historic Overlay Zone.

City Departments and other interested agencies were given the opportunity to review this application from 11/3/09 to 11/13/09. Agency comments that were received were used in the preparation of this report, and begin on page 9.

Development Review Division Report:

SUMMARY OF REQUEST

<i>Requests</i>	Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction
<i>Historic Location</i>	Eighth and Forrester Historic Overlay Zone

AREA HISTORY AND CHARACTER

Surrounding architectural styles, historic character and recent (re)development

	<i># of Stories</i>	<i>Roof Configuration, Architectural Style and Approximate Age of Construction</i>	<i>Historic Classification & Land Use</i>
<i>General Area</i>	1-2	Hipped, gabled and flat, Simplified Queen Anne, Bungalow, Southwest Vernacular	Contributing and Non-contributing, residential
<i>Site to the North</i>	1	Hipped Box 1910	Contributing, residential
<i>Sites to the South</i>	1	Gabled; no style; 1995	Non-Contributing; residential
<i>Sites to the East</i>	1	Gabled; Queen Anne; 1907	Contributing, residential
<i>Site to the West</i>	1	Flat roofed Pueblo revival; 1925	Contributing, residential

BACKGROUND

The Eighth and Forrester Historic District is described in the State and National Register nomination as "a fine and little-altered neighborhood of simple lower-middle class housing, predominately from the first decade of the twentieth century." The nomination also states: "Developed and largely built up in the first decade of the twentieth century, the Eighth Street/Forrester Historic District is an excellent example of a working-class neighborhood, unscarred by substantial modern alteration or intrusion. The district is most important for its architecture, for its small, simple and attractive houses, scaled-down version of styles popular in the period between 1901 and 1925."

Simple cottages are the predominant form in this district. A few larger houses, described as late adaptations of the Queen Anne style, are larger primarily by comparison with the simple cottages. There are a number of southwestern revival styles built between 1922 and 1929, and these houses resemble the earlier cottages in their modest size and ornamentation.

The house at 1005 Forrester is a one-story gabled roofed single family home that was built in the mid-1990's. It is Non-contributing to the historic district. The new house's scale, form and simple detail harmonize well with the surrounding Contributing buildings.

The applicant proposes to construct an accessory building in the rear yard of approximately 432 square feet. The new building would have a gable roof with a pitch similar to the main house. The simple building would also use stucco exterior finish, asphalt shingles and wood window and door, also similar to the main house. The building would be minimally visible from the street if traveling south, and not visible if traveling north.

APPLICABLE PLANS, ORDINANCES, DESIGN GUIDELINES & POLICIES

Albuquerque-Bernalillo County Comprehensive Plan of 1988, amended 2003

The plan sets out goals and policies concerning land use, environmental protection and heritage conservation. Chapter II, Section 5, Historic Resources Goals and Policies (pp. II-61-II-62) states:

"The Goal for Historic Resources is to protect, reuse or enhance significant historic buildings and districts."

Applicable Historic Resources policies include:

Policy a: Efforts to provide incentives for the protection of significant buildings and districts shall be continued and expanded.

Policy b: Research, evaluation, and protection of historical and cultural properties in the City and County shall be continued where appropriate.

Policy c: Increase public and inter-agency awareness of historic resources and preservation

This site is contained in the Central Urban Development Area, a portion of the Established Urban Development Area as defined in the *Comprehensive Plan*, and is subject to the policies of Section II.B.5 (Established Urban Area) as well as the Central Urban Area policies. The Goal of the Central Urban Area is to "promote the Central Urban Area as a focus for arts, cultural, and public facilities/activities while recognizing and enhancing the character of its residential neighborhoods and its importance as the historic center of the City."

The Goal of the Established Urban Area is to "create a quality urban environment which perpetuates the tradition of identifiable, individual, but integrated communities within the metropolitan area and which offers variety and maximum choice in housing, transportation, work areas, and life styles, while creating a visually pleasing built environment."

Applicable Established Urban Area policies include:

Policy d: "The location, intensity, and design of new development shall respect existing neighborhood values, natural environmental conditions and carrying capacities, scenic resources, and resources of other social, cultural, and recreational concern."

Policy o: "Redevelopment and rehabilitation of older neighborhoods in the Established Urban Area shall be continued and strengthened."

Resolution –046-1991 Designating the Fourth Ward and Eighth and Forrester Historic Overlay Zones (1991)

This resolution designated, mapped, and provided general guidelines for the establishment of the Fourth Ward and Eighth and Forrester Historic Overlay Zones. For this case, this resolution will be referred to only as it applies to the Eighth and Forrester Historic Overlay Zone and the subject property contained therein, excluding references to the Fourth Ward Historic Overlay Zone. Contained within this resolution are general guidelines, of which the specific Eighth and Forrester Historic Overlay Zone Design Guidelines are derived.

Design Guidelines for the Eighth Street and Forrester Historic Overlay Zone

The Eighth Street/Forrester Historic Overlay Zone was established by the City Council in 1991 (R-046-1991). This designation mapped the overlay zone and established certain general guidelines. The Landmarks and Urban Conservation Commission approved specific development guidelines as delegated by the Council.

Landmarks and Urban Conservation Ordinance

This site consists of a non-contributing property in the Eighth and Forrester Historic Overlay Zone and the project is subject to certain provisions of the Landmarks and Urban Conservation Ordinance (Article 12, R.O.A., 1994). The purpose of this ordinance is to:

"Preserve, protect, enhance, perpetuate and promote the use of structures and areas of historical, cultural, architectural, engineering, archeological or geographic significance located in the city; to strengthen the city's economic base by stimulating the tourist industry; to enhance the identity of the city by protecting the city's heritage and prohibiting the unnecessary destruction or defacement of its cultural assets; and to conserve existing urban developments as viable economic and social entities."

Section 14-12-8 (A) of the LUC ordinance provides that:

"Within the boundaries of a historic zone, urban conservation overlay zone, or landmark site, the exterior appearance of any structure shall not be altered, new structures shall not be constructed, and existing structures shall not be demolished until a Certificate of Appropriateness has been duly approved."

ANALYSIS

The development guidelines for the Eight and Forrester Historic Overlay Zone provide no specific criteria for new construction of accessory buildings. The guidelines for new construction are specific to single and multi family houses and commercial buildings.

The proposed accessory building utilizes exterior building materials such as stucco and wood that are common to the area. Some glass block is included on the north elevation. The use of this material does not adversely affect the district. The simple form, height and detail compliment the surrounding historic houses. The proposed building is located in the rear yard and will be only minimally visible from the street.

LUC Ordinance

The table below provides an evaluation of the submittal as it relates to the LUC Ordinance and the specific development guidelines as analyzed above.

LUC Ordinance (§14-12) Guidelines for New Construction	Analysis	Does the application satisfy the ordinance criteria?
§14-12-8-B-(1) The change is consistent with the designation ordinance and specific development guidelines for the historic overlay zone	There is nothing about the proposed accessory building that is in conflict with the ordinance or the guidelines.	YES
§14-12-8 (B) (2) The architectural character, historical value, or archaeological value of the structure or site itself or of any historic zone in which it is located will not be significantly impaired or diminished	The proposed accessory building is compatible in scale, material and building form with the buildings in the district . It will be minimally visible from the street.	YES
§14-12-8 (B) (3) The change qualified as a "certified rehabilitation: pursuant to the Tax Reform Act of 1976		Not applicable
§14-12-8 (B) (4) The structure or site's distinguished original qualities or character will not be altered. Original shall mean at the time of initial construction or developed over the course of history of the structure.		Not applicable
§14-12-8 (B) (5) Deteriorated architectural features should be repaired rather than replaced, if possible. If replacement is necessary, the new material shall match the original as closely as		Not applicable

possible in like material and design;		
§14-12-8 (B) (6) Additions to existing structure and new construction may be of contemporary design if such design is compatible with the historic zone in which it is to be located		Not applicable
§14-12-8 (B) (7) Demolition shall only be permitted.		Not applicable

Additional Considerations

The Downtown Neighborhood Association was notified of this request. No comment has been received.

CONCLUSIONS

The specific development guidelines for the Eighth and Forrester Historic Overlay Zone provide no specific guidance with regard to accessory buildings. However, general principles conveyed in the guidelines can be applied.

The proposed accessory building is of similar style and massing as the main house and utilizes similar building materials. It is subordinate to the main house, as an accessory should be. This is an appropriate approach.

It is to be located in the rear yard and will be minimally visible from the right-of way. This is also an appropriate approach.

The integrity of the streetscape or the historic district is not negatively affected by the proposed structure.

FINDINGS for a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction - Case #09-LUCC-50043 / Project # 1008057 (November 18, 2009)

1. This application is a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a new accessory building at 1005 Forrester NW, described as Lot 35 of the Coronado Addition, in the Eighth and Forrester Historic Overlay Zone, zoned SU-2/SF.
2. The subject property contains a one-story gable roofed house, built in the 1990's and is Non-contributing to the Eighth and Forrester Historic District.
3. The proposal is to construct a 432 sq. ft. accessory building in the rear yard. The new building will have a gabled roof, stucco exterior and minimal detail. The proposed building will be only minimally visible from the public right-of-way.
4. The work that is described above is consistent with the Development Guidelines for Eighth and Forrester Historic Overlay Zone. It utilizes forms and materials similar to those found on the main house and on other buildings in the historic district.
5. New construction in the overlay zone is subject to the provisions of LUC Ordinance.
6. The LUC Ordinance specifies that an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness shall be approved if it complies with several specified criteria. The work that is described above is consistent with relevant provisions in the LUC Ordinance Section 14-12-8-B- 1 and 2 as analyzed in the staff report.
7. The proposal is consistent with the designation ordinance R-046-1991.
8. This proposal furthers the Comprehensive Plan goals and policies for historic resources that include to "protect, reuse or enhance significant historic buildings and districts."

RECOMMENDATION - Case No. 09-LUCC-50043/Project # 1008057 (November 18, 2009)

APPROVAL of 09-LUCC-50043/Project # 1008057, an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction, located at 1005 Forrester NW. This property is more specifically described as Lot 35, Coronado Place Addition, a non-contributing property in the Eighth and Forrester Historic Overlay Zone, zoned SU-2/SF, based on the above 8 Findings and subject to the following Conditions:

Conditions of Approval Recommended for Case No. 09-LUCC-50043/Project # 1008057:

1. The applicant is to comply with all other relevant City of Albuquerque permits, policies and procedures.
-

**Maryellen Hennessy, Senior Planner,
Current Planning Division**

Attachments

CITY OF ALBUQUERQUE AGENCY COMMENTS

ZONING CODE SERVICES DIVISION

NO RESPONSE

BUILDING & SAFETY SERVICES DIVISION

APPROVED. Permit submittal required.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION/ADVANCED PLANNING

NO RESPONSE

PNM

ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH DEPARTMENT

SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT DEPARTMENT

FIRE DEPARTMENT/Planning

COMMENTS FROM OTHER AGENCIES, WHEN APPLICABLE:

TRANSIT DEPARTMENT

POLICE DEPARTMENT

PARKS AND GENERAL SERVICES

OPEN SPACE DIVISION

BERNALILLO COUNTY

ALBUQUERQUE FLOOD CONTROL AUTHORITY

ALBUQUERQUE PUBLIC SCHOOLS

MIDDLE RIO GRANDE COUNCIL OF GOVERNMENTS